Statistics and Probability Letters 118 (2016) 135–138

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Statistics and Probability Letters

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/stapro

Persistently unbounded probability densities

Wiebe Pestman *, Francis Tuerlinckx, Wolf Vanpaemel

University of Leuven, Tiensestraat 102, 3000 Leuven, Belgium

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received 13 June 2016
Accepted 22 June 2016
Available online 9 July 2016

Keywords:
Convolution powers
Unbounded
Central limit theorems

ABSTRACT

The paper provides examples of how to construct probability densities whose convolution powers are all unbounded. This persistent form of unboundedness is related to a premise in a well-known local central limit theorem.

© 2016 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

In probability theory, roughly spoken, a central limit theorem (CLT) states that, given certain conditions on their moments and mutual dependence, the arithmetic mean of a sufficiently large number of iterates of random variables will be approximately normally distributed, irrespective of their underlying distribution. To set some notation in this, suppose that $X_1, X_2, X_3, \ldots$ is a sequence of random variables with existing mean and variance. Define for all $n = 1, 2, 3, \ldots$ the random variable Y_n as

$$Y_n = \frac{X_1 + X_2 + \cdots + X_n}{n}. \tag{1}$$

Let Z_n be the variable Y_n in a standardised form, that is:

$$Z_n = \frac{Y_n - \mathbb{E}(Y_n)}{\sqrt{\mathbb{V}\mathrm{ar}(Y_n)}}. \tag{2}$$

A most basic CLT states that, if the sequence $n = 1, 2, 3, \ldots$ is i.i.d., the sequence of cdf's F_{Z_n} converges pointwise to the cdf Φ of the standard Gaussian distribution. The limit function Φ being continuous, it can be proved that this convergence is actually uniform on $\mathbb{R}$ (see for example Pestman, 2009; Petrov, 1976; Rényi, 2007).

Now suppose that one is in the frequently assumed scenario where the X_k have a common density f. Then the Z_n also have a density, which we will denote by f_{Z_n}. This density can be expressed in terms of convolution powers of f, that is to say, powers of the form

$$f^{*n} = \underbrace{f * f * \cdots * f}_{n \text{ factors}}. \tag{3}$$

In terms of such powers f_{Z_n} may be expressed as:

$$f_{Z_n}(z) = \sigma\sqrt{n} f^{*n}\big(\sigma\sqrt{n}\, z + n\mu\big). \tag{4}$$

* Corresponding author.
E-mail address: wrpestman@gmail.com (W. Pestman).

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.spl.2016.06.021
0167-7152/© 2016 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

In the above μ and σ^2 stand for the mean and variance of the density f. One may wonder under which conditions the sequence of densities f_{Z_n} converges in some sense to the density φ of the standard Gaussian distribution. Results of this type are called *local central limit theorems*. Such theorems can, roughly spoken, be classified as to the mode of convergence of the f_{Z_n}. For example, in Prokhorov (2016) a local CLT is established that assures, under suitable conditions, the f_{Z_n} to converge in mean to φ. In Rango Rao and Varadarajan (1960) a similar theorem assures pointwise convergence almost everywhere as to this. In this paper we will focus on a local CLT, proved by B.V. Gnedenko (see Gnedenko, 2016), that assures uniform convergence of the f_{Z_n} to φ. Among the premises in this theorem one finds a boundedness condition on the convolution powers f^{*n}. In the following, functions for which for every n the convolution power f^{*n} is an unbounded function will be called *persistently unbounded*. A function that fails to be persistently unbounded will be called *eventually bounded*. Hence, a function f is eventually bounded if there exists an integer n such that (3) is a bounded function. For the convolution product of two integrable functions f and g one generally has (see Rudin, 1987; Schwartz, 2008) the following inequality

$$\|f * g\|_\infty \leq \|f\|_\infty \|g\|_1. \tag{5}$$

It follows from this that, if f^{*n} is bounded for some n, then f^{*m} is bounded for all $m \geq n$. The concept of eventual boundedness plays a crucial role in Gnedenko's CLT:

Theorem 1. *Let $n = 1, 2, 3, \ldots$ be an i.i.d. sequence of random variables with existing expectation and variance. Suppose that the X_k have a common density f. Then the densities f_{Z_n} converge uniformly to the density of the standard Gaussian distribution if and only if f is eventually bounded.*

A proof of this result can be found for example in Gnedenko (2016) or Rényi (2007). Note that, under the premise of a finite mean and variance for the density f, the classical CLT guarantees that

$$\lim_{n\to\infty} \|F_{Z_n} - \Phi\|_\infty = 0. \tag{6}$$

Theorem 1 states that, in the case of an eventually bounded density f, one has

$$\lim_{n\to\infty} \|f_{Z_n} - \varphi\|_\infty = 0. \tag{7}$$

If f fails to be eventually bounded, then, because of (4), the density f_{Z_n} is unbounded for all n. The standard Gaussian density φ being bounded, one necessarily has

$$\|f_{Z_n} - \varphi\|_\infty = +\infty \quad \text{for all } n. \tag{8}$$

Hence there is a striking dichotomy as to convergence of the f_{Z_n}: one either has (7) or (8) and eventual boundedness of f is conclusive in this. Note that the scenario of (8) does not exclude weaker forms of convergence, such as converge in mean or pointwise convergence almost everywhere (see Prokhorov, 2016; Rango Rao and Varadarajan, 1960).

Let us focus now a bit on the concept of eventual boundedness. A bounded density is, of course, always eventually bounded. An eventually bounded density is, however, not always bounded:

Example. Define for every $a > 0$ the function f_a as

$$f_a(x) = \begin{cases} \dfrac{1}{\Gamma(a)} x^{a-1} e^{-x} & \text{if } x > 0 \\ 0 & \text{elsewhere.} \end{cases} \tag{9}$$

These functions, being gamma-densities, satisfy the following permanence property as to convolution:

$$f_a * f_b = f_{a+b}. \tag{10}$$

See for example Pestman (2009) or Schwartz (2008) for a proof of the above. In particular one has:

$$f^{*n} = f_{na}. \tag{11}$$

The functions f_a are unbounded for $0 < a < 1$ and bounded for $a \geq 1$. From the above it follows that an unbounded density f_a can be turned into a bounded density by raising it to a convolution power n with $na \geq 1$. Hence, unbounded gamma densities are eventually bounded. □

In mathematical analysis it is well-known that the convolution product $f * g$ of two integrable functions f and g usually shows more regularity than each of the components (see for example Rudin, 1976, 1987; Schwartz, 2008). This also applies when interpreting boundedness as a form of regularity. For that reason most densities encountered in daily statistical life are eventually bounded. Actually one may wonder how to construct examples of densities that fail to be eventually bounded, that is, persistently unbounded densities. The following section will be devoted to this.

2. Constructing persistently unbounded functions

In this section we construct examples of persistently unbounded functions. To this end we set up a small machinery. First we define a family of functions $\{\varphi_a\}$, where $a > 0$, by

$$\varphi_a(x) = \begin{cases} |x|^{a-1} & \text{if } 0 < |x| < 1 \\ 0 & \text{elsewhere.} \end{cases} \tag{12}$$

In terms of the φ_a we define:

Definition. A function $f : \mathbb{R} \to [0, +\infty)$ will be said to be *locally minorised* by φ_a if there exist two positive constants ε and A such that

$$f(x) \geq A\varphi_a(x) \quad \text{for all } 0 < |x| < \varepsilon.$$

In proving the existence of persistently unbounded functions, the following theorem will be useful.

Theorem 2. *If f is locally minorised by φ_a and similarly g by φ_b, then $f * g$ is locally minorised by φ_{a+b}.*

Proof. If f and g are locally minorised by φ_a and φ_b respectively, then there exist positive constants A, B and $0 < \varepsilon < 1$ such that

$$f(x) \geq A\,|x|^{a-1} \quad \text{and} \quad g(x) \geq B\,|x|^{b-1} \tag{13}$$

for all x with $0 < |x| < \varepsilon$. If $0 < x < \varepsilon$, then one has

$$f * g(x) \geq \int_0^x f(x-t)\, g(t)\, \mathrm{d}t \geq AB \int_0^x \varphi_a(x-t)\, \varphi_b(t)\, \mathrm{d}t. \tag{14}$$

By a substitution $t = xs$ the integral on the right can be resolved into

$$\int_0^1 \varphi_a(x - xs)\, \varphi_b(xs)\, x\, \mathrm{d}s = x^{a+b-1} \int_0^1 (1-s)^{a-1}\, s^{b-1}\, \mathrm{d}s = \mathrm{B}(a, b)\, x^{a+b-1}. \tag{15}$$

Here $\mathrm{B}(\bullet, \bullet)$ stands for the Beta-function. Combining this with (14) it follows that

$$f * g(x) \geq AB\,\mathrm{B}(a, b)\, x^{a+b-1} \quad \text{for } 0 < x < \varepsilon. \tag{16}$$

In a similar way this can be deduced for $-\varepsilon < x < 0$, thus completing the proof. □

Now consider the following candidate for being persistently unbounded:

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} \dfrac{1}{|x|} \exp\left\{ -\dfrac{\log(1/|x|)}{\log(\log(1/|x|))} \right\} & \text{if } 0 < |x| < \dfrac{1}{e^2} \\ 0 & \text{elsewhere.} \end{cases} \tag{17}$$

For the integral of this function one has

$$\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} f(x)\, \mathrm{d}x = 2 \int_0^{1/e^2} f(x)\, \mathrm{d}x. \tag{18}$$

Via a substitution $x = e^{-u}$ one gets

$$\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} f(x)\, \mathrm{d}x = 2 \int_2^{+\infty} \exp\left\{ -\frac{u}{\log(u)} \right\} \mathrm{d}u = 2 \int_2^{+\infty} \exp\left\{ -\frac{\sqrt{u}}{\log(u)} \sqrt{u} \right\} \mathrm{d}u. \tag{19}$$

There exists a positive constant C such that

$$\frac{\sqrt{u}}{\log(u)} \geq C \quad \text{for all } u \in [2, +\infty). \tag{20}$$

Combining this with (19) it follows that

$$\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} f(x)\, \mathrm{d}x \leq 2 \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(-C\sqrt{u}\right)\, \mathrm{d}x < +\infty. \tag{21}$$

Hence f is a non-negative integrable function. In spite of this the function f turns out to be locally minorised by φ_a for arbitrary $a > 0$. This is a consequence of the fact that:

$$\lim_{x\uparrow 0} \frac{f(x)}{\varphi_a(x)} = \lim_{x\downarrow 0} \frac{f(x)}{\varphi_a(x)} = \lim_{u\to +\infty} \frac{f(e^{-u})}{\varphi_a(e^{-u})} = \lim_{u\to +\infty} \exp\left\{\left(a - \frac{1}{\log(u)}\right)u\right\} = +\infty. \tag{22}$$

To see that f is persistently unbounded, let n be any positive integer. Choose a number $a > 0$ so small that $na < 1$. Then, by Theorem 2, the convolution power f^{*n} is locally minorised by φ_{na}. The latter function being unbounded, it follows that f^{*n} is also unbounded. It thus appears that f is persistently unbounded. This property is conserved when normalising f towards a probability density. The resulting probability density has a compact support and thus it has moments of all orders. Hence the classical CLT holds when sampling from a population with this density. In spite of this one is in the scenario described by (8), that is, one has $\|f_{Z_n} - \varphi\|_\infty = +\infty$ for all n.

An alternative construction of persistently unbounded functions could proceed as follows: Choose two sequences $\{a_n\}$ and $\{b_n\}$, both consisting of strictly positive numbers, such that

$$\lim_{n\to\infty} b_n = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} a_k < +\infty. \tag{23}$$

Then define the function $f : \mathbb{R} \to [0, +\infty)$ as

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} \dfrac{1}{|x|} \displaystyle\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} a_k b_k |x|^{b_k} & \text{if } 0 < |x| < 1 \\ 0 & \text{elsewhere.} \end{cases} \tag{24}$$

It is readily seen that the defining series for f converges for all x. Moreover, applying Lebesgue's limit theorems, one easily learns that the function has a finite integral. For every $a > 0$ the function f is locally minorised by φ_a. To see this, choose any $a > 0$. Then there exists an integer m such that $b_m < a$. For this m one has:

$$f(x) \geq a_m b_m |x|^{b_m - 1} \geq a_m b_m \varphi_a(x) \quad \text{for all } |x| < 1. \tag{25}$$

It follows that, indeed, f is locally minorised by φ_a for all $a > 0$. In the way explained earlier, this implies that the function must be persistently unbounded. After normalisation one arrives at a persistently unbounded probability density with compact support, thus having moments of all orders.

References

Gnedenko, B.V., 2016. A local limit theorem for densities. Dokl. Akad. Nauk. SSSR 95, 5–7.
Pestman, W.R., 2009. Mathematical Statistics, second ed.. De Gruyter Verlag, Berlin.
Petrov, V.V., 1976. Sums of Independent Random Variables. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
Prokhorov, Yu.V., 2016. On a local limit theorem for densities. Dokl. Akad. Nauk. SSSR 83, 797–800.
Rango Rao, R., Varadarajan, V.S., 1960. A limit theorem for densities. Sankhya 22, 261–266.
Rényi, A., 2007. Foundations of Probability. Dover Publications, Inc., New York.
Rudin, W., 1976. Principles of Mathematical Analysis. McGraw-Hill, New York.
Rudin, W., 1987. Real and Complex Analysis. McGraw-Hill, New York.
Schwartz, L., 2008. Mathematics for the Physical Sciences. Dover Publications.